

Chairmen's Committee

PUBLIC MEETING

Record of Meeting

Date: 12.11.09

Meeting No: 32

Present	Senator B. E. Shenton, President Deputy R.G. Le Hérissier, Vice-President Senator A. Breckon Senator S.C. Ferguson Deputy P.J. Rondel Deputy S. Pitman (representing Economic Affairs Scrutiny Panel)
Apologies	Deputy M.R. Higgins
Absent	
In attendance	Mrs K. Tremellen-Frost, Scrutiny Manager

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
	1. Minutes The minutes of the 15th and 19th October 2009 having been agreed, were accordingly signed.	
	2. Panel Activity reports These were noted	
513/18(8)	3. Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel Review into Population Policy (SR3/2009): evaluation The Committee noted the evaluation of the above review.	
514/12(8)	4. Environment Panel: Review into Environmental Taxes The Committee noted the scoping document and terms of reference for a review into Environmental Taxes.	
	5. Requests by Ministers for Scrutiny Panel representatives to serve on Executive Panels/Boards A number of Ministers had suggested to respective Scrutiny Panels that Panels should have representatives working on Executive working groups. In view of the fact that this would place Members and Panels in difficult positions if they disagreed with the working group and subsequently wished to review the outcomes of the group it was agreed that it was inappropriate for scrutiny to be working on Executive initiatives and all Panels should decline such offers. This did not preclude Members serving in a private capacity.	
17.09.09 item 10 511/1(37)	6. Standing Orders proposed amendment: all non-Executive to serve on scrutiny The Committee received correspondence dated 16th October 2009 from the Privileges and Procedures Committee in respect of the Committee's request to that Committee that it should consider amending Standing Orders so that all non-Executive Members were compelled to serve on Scrutiny. The Privileges and Procedures Committee considered that it would not be	

	possible to compel Members to serve on scrutiny and that Members must be free to choose their own methods of working and to focus on areas where they feel they can have the most impact.	
17.09.09 item 10 511/1(37)	<p>7. Proposed review of the rôle of Assistant Ministers</p> <p>The Committee received correspondence dated 16th October 2009 from the Privileges and Procedures Committee in respect of the Committee's request for a review into the rôle and workload of Assistant Ministers and the possibility of them serving on Scrutiny Panels.</p> <p>The Privileges and Procedures Committee believed that there was no evidence of any Assistant Ministers having a light workload and also believed that if they were to be able to serve on Scrutiny Panels then the same would apply to Ministers. It further referred to the Machinery of Government Review which had considered this and had felt that that Ministers and Assistant Ministers were part of the executive and their rôles should not be confused.</p>	
17.09.09 item 10 511/1(37)	<p>8. Standing Orders: proposed review to appoint Scrutiny Panel Chairmen prior to Assistant Ministers.</p> <p>Correspondence date 16th October 2009 from Privileges and Procedures Committee was received in respect of the Committee's request to review Standing Orders: so that Scrutiny Panel Chairmen were appointed prior to Assistant Ministers. The Privileges and Procedures Committee felt that the appointment of Scrutiny Panel Chairmen was as immediate as possible under the current system and it could not prevent private conversations taking place with regard to the allocation of Assistant Ministers.</p>	
17.09.09 item 10 511/1(37)	<p>9. Standing Orders: proposed review to ensure newly elected Members serve firstly on scrutiny.</p> <p>The Committee received correspondence dated 16th October 2009 from the Privileges and Procedures Committee in respect of the Committee's request that Standing Orders be reviewed to ensure newly elected Members serve firstly on scrutiny.</p> <p>The Privileges and Procedures Committee did not feel that it would be appropriate to restrict members in this way.</p>	
15.10.09 item 3	<p>10. Ministerial Responses</p> <p>The Committee was to meet the Council of Ministers on this day and were to discuss the following:-</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. A proposal from the Council of Ministers that Scrutiny reports would include an assessment of any cost or manpower implications of each recommendation; 2. Ministers would identify the cost and/or manpower implications of the recommendations and include in Ministerial responses; 3. The timetable for response from Ministers should be discussed between the Panel and the Minister before the scrutiny report is published. 	
15.10.09 item 7	<p>11. Travel and Subsistence Policy</p> <p>The Committee noted that Ministers followed the Departmental travel policy of the respective department. These were based on the States of Jersey Financial Direction 5.2. In respect of Ministers, expenditure for travel, accommodation and subsistence were approved in advance by the relevant Accounting Officer. The level of subsistence approved was</p>	

	<p>determined through reasonableness but based on the guidelines from Human Resources for subsistence.</p> <p>Noting that the scrutiny policy was in line with Executive Departmental Policy, the Committee accordingly approved it.</p>	KTF
510/1(3)	<p>12. Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel: visit to House of Commons and the Welsh Assembly</p> <p>The Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel had taken up the offer of visiting other jurisdictions by way of training. All the Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel Members had visited the House of Commons on 9th November and the Welsh Assembly on 10th and 11th November 2009.</p>	
15.10.09 item 10 511/1(39)	<p>13. States Building</p> <p>The suggestion of reconfiguring the table in the Le Capelain and opening the doors outwards had been investigated. The Committee welcomed the Director of Architecture to the meeting.</p> <p>The Committee was apprised of estimated costs, related matters and the status of the building as listed in respect of opening the doors outwards.</p> <p>The Committee agreed to leave the table as currently configured to allow all Panels to have time to use the room for various types of meetings and hearings and to give views on the new layout. It was also agreed to leave the doors opening inwards until the trial had been completed.</p>	
15.10.09 item 11	<p>14. Away morning</p> <p>The Committee approved funding for the use of an external venue but agreed that this should be located in St. Helier.</p> <p>The format for the morning would be drawn up by the President and Vice-President with the Scrutiny Manager & be discussed at the December meeting. It was noted that all scrutiny members had been asked for agenda items and that only one discussion item had been received. It agreed that recognition of scrutiny recommendations, how to be more effective and the rôle of Assistant Ministers should be considered.</p>	BS/RL H/KTF
	<p>15. Scheduling of Scrutiny Hearings</p> <p>The Committee considered a suggestion from the Council of Ministers that Scrutiny Hearings which involved Ministers should not be scheduled for days when the Council of Ministers had scheduled meetings. The Committee noted the difficulties experienced in scheduling hearings especially due to the lengthy and frequent Assembly meetings. It was agreed to discuss this with the Council of Ministers at the joint meeting of this day.</p>	
17.09.09 item 11 1240/10 (36)	<p>16. Public recordings of scrutiny events</p> <p>The Committee considered the question of Deputy M. Tadier to the President in the States on 3rd November 2009 asking him to consider an interim ban on all filming and photography pending proper guidelines, or if not, to put an end to the policy which required members of the citizens' media to give three days notice.</p> <p>The Committee noted that the media working group was now established and would consider all these issues.</p> <p>It was considered that the group should look for an additional member who</p>	

	was a backbencher but not necessarily involved in scrutiny in order to provide balance to the group.	BS																		
	<p>17. Meetings of the Chairmen's Committee 2010</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td>Proposed Meetings of CC : 12.30pm - 2.30pm</td> </tr> <tr> <td>14th January</td> </tr> <tr> <td>28th January</td> </tr> <tr> <td>18th February</td> </tr> <tr> <td>18th March 12.00-1.45pm</td> </tr> <tr> <td>EASTER RECESS</td> </tr> <tr> <td>29th April</td> </tr> <tr> <td>20th May</td> </tr> <tr> <td>17th June 12.00-1.45pm</td> </tr> <tr> <td>15th July</td> </tr> <tr> <td>SUMMER RECESS</td> </tr> <tr> <td>23rd September</td> </tr> <tr> <td>28th October</td> </tr> <tr> <td>25th November 12.00 - 1.45pm</td> </tr> <tr> <td>XMAS RECESS</td> </tr> <tr> <td>16th December</td> </tr> </table>	Proposed Meetings of CC : 12.30pm - 2.30pm	14th January	28th January	18th February	18th March 12.00-1.45pm	EASTER RECESS	29th April	20th May	17th June 12.00-1.45pm	15th July	SUMMER RECESS	23rd September	28th October	25th November 12.00 - 1.45pm	XMAS RECESS	16th December			
Proposed Meetings of CC : 12.30pm - 2.30pm																				
14th January																				
28th January																				
18th February																				
18th March 12.00-1.45pm																				
EASTER RECESS																				
29th April																				
20th May																				
17th June 12.00-1.45pm																				
15th July																				
SUMMER RECESS																				
23rd September																				
28th October																				
25th November 12.00 - 1.45pm																				
XMAS RECESS																				
16th December																				
	<p>18. Council of Ministers meeting dates</p> <table> <tr> <td>14th January</td> <td>28th January</td> </tr> <tr> <td>11th February</td> <td>4th March</td> </tr> <tr> <td>18th March</td> <td>1st April</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6th May</td> <td>20th May</td> </tr> <tr> <td>17th June</td> <td>1st July</td> </tr> <tr> <td>15th July</td> <td>2nd September</td> </tr> <tr> <td>23rd September</td> <td>7th October</td> </tr> <tr> <td>28th October</td> <td>11th November</td> </tr> <tr> <td>25th November</td> <td>16th December</td> </tr> </table>	14 th January	28 th January	11 th February	4 th March	18 th March	1 st April	6 th May	20 th May	17 th June	1 st July	15 th July	2 nd September	23 rd September	7 th October	28 th October	11 th November	25 th November	16 th December	
14 th January	28 th January																			
11 th February	4 th March																			
18 th March	1 st April																			
6 th May	20 th May																			
17 th June	1 st July																			
15 th July	2 nd September																			
23 rd September	7 th October																			
28 th October	11 th November																			
25 th November	16 th December																			
	<p>19. Joint Chairmen's Committee and Council of ministers: meeting dates 2010</p> <p>It was agreed with the Council that there would be three meeting dates in 2010:</p> <p>18th March 17th June 25th November</p>																			
	<p>20. Date of next meeting</p> <p>The next meeting was scheduled for 17th December 2009 commencing at 12.30pm.</p>																			

Signed

R. Le Hérissier

Date:

17/12/09

Deputy R. Le Hérissier, Vice- President (in absence of President)